

**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE THIRD CIRCUIT**

No. 03-3176

LEROY "BUD" BENSEL, JAMES ARTHUR, PATRICK BRADY,
THEODORE A. CASE, MATTHEW J. COMLISH, DARSHANPRIT
DHILLON, LEMUEL A. DOUGHERTY, MICHAEL V. FINUCAN, JOHN
S. HEFLEY, HOWARD B. HOLLANDER, ROBERT A. PASTORE and
SALLY YOUNG

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION, AIR LINE PILOTS ASSOCIATION,
AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC., and TWA AIRLINES, LLC

Defendants-Appellees

On Appeal from the United States District Court for the District of New
Jersey

BRIEF OF APPELLEE ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION

James Katz
SAGOT, JENNINGS & SIGMOND
Summit Buildings
1040 North Kings Highway, Suite 300
Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08034
(856) 667-6950
(856) 667-6982 FAX

Edgar N. James
Steven K. Hoffman
Kathy L. Krieger
JAMES & HOFFMAN, P.C.
1101 17th Street, N.W., Suite 510
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 496-0500
(202) 496-0555 FAX

ATTORNEYS FOR APPELLEE
ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	ii
BRIEF OF APPELLEE ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION	1
STATEMENT OF ISSUES	1
COUNTERSTATEMENT OF THE CASE	1
COUNTERSTATEMENT OF FACTS	8
STATEMENT OF RELATED CASES AND PROCEEDINGS	16
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	16
ARGUMENT	18
I. Standard of Review	18
II. The District Court Correctly Dismissed The Class' Fair Representation Claim Against the APA	22
A. Because the APA Had No Fair Representation Duty to the Class Prior to Certification, It Could Not Have Breached Any Such Duty During that Period	23
B. The Class Has Failed to Assert a Colorable Post-Certification Duty of Fair Representation Claim Against the APA	33
III. The District Court Correctly Ruled That All of the Class' State Law Claims Are Preempted and Extinguished by the RLA	40
IV. Even If the APA Had Had A Pre-Certification Duty to the Class, Any Claim of Breach of that Duty Would Be Time-Barred	45
CONCLUSION	51

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<u>Abramson v. Univ. of Haw.</u> , 594 F.2d 202 (9th Cir. 1979)	48
<u>Aeronautical Indus. Dist. Lodge 727 v. Campbell</u> , 337 U.S. 521 (1949)	36
<u>AFA v. Delta Air Lines, Inc.</u> , 879 F.2d 906 (D.C. Cir. 1989)	29
<u>ALEA v. Republic Airlines, Inc.</u> , 798 F.2d 967 (7th Cir. 1986)	29
<u>Allen v. American Airlines, Inc.</u> , No. CV-N-99-539-DWH(RAM), slip op. (D. Nev. Sept. 14, 2001)	26
<u>Allied Chem. & Alkali Workers v. Pittsburgh Plate Glass Co.</u> , 404 U.S. 157 (1971)	28, 31
<u>Allied Pilots Association v. Bensel</u> (N.D. Tex. June 6, 2002)	3, 16
<u>ALPA v. Aloha Airlines, Inc.</u> , 126 L.R.R.M. (BNA) 2822 (D. Hawaii 1987) ...	38
<u>ALPA v. Pan Am. World Airways, Inc.</u> , 765 F.2d 377 (2d Cir. 1985)	38
<u>ALPA v. Tex. Int'l Airlines, Inc.</u> , 656 F.2d 16 (2d Cir. 1981)	29
<u>ALPA v. United Air Lines, Inc.</u> , 802 F.2d 886 (7th Cir. 1986)	27
<u>Am. Airlines, Inc.</u> , 29 NMB 201 (2002)	15
<u>Am. Airlines, Inc.</u> , 29 NMB 260 (2002)	16
<u>Anderson v. Alpha Portland Indus., Inc.</u> , 727 F.2d 177 (8th Cir. 1984)	28
<u>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc.</u> , 477 U.S. 242 (1986)	19, 20, 33
<u>Anjelino v. N.Y. Times Co.</u> , 200 F.3d 73 (3d Cir. 1999)	21, 30
<u>AFA v. USAir, Inc.</u> , 24 F.3d 1432 (D.C. Cir. 1994)	36

<u>A.T. Kearney, Inc., v. IBM</u> , 73 F.3d 238 (9th Cir. 1995)	27
<u>Bell Atl.-Pa. v. Pa. Pub. Util. Comm'n</u> , 273 F.3d 337 (3d Cir. 2001), <u>cert denied</u> , 537 U.S. 941 (2002)	35
<u>Bensel v. ALPA</u> , Civ. Action No. 02cv4284 (D.N.J.)	16
<u>Bernard v. ALPA</u> , 873 F.2d 213 (9 th Cir. 1989)	30, 31, 32
<u>Bhd. of Ry. & S.S. Clerks v. United Air Lines Inc.</u> , 325 F.2d 576 (6th Cir. 1963)	29
<u>BIW Deceived v. Local 56, Indus. Union of Marine & Shipbuilding Workers</u> , 132 F.3d 824 (1st Cir. 1997)	42, 43
<u>Brotherhood of R.R. Trainmen v. Howard</u> , 343 U.S. 768 (1952)	30, 31
<u>Bhd. of R.R. Trainmen v. Jacksonville Terminal Co.</u> , 394 U.S. 369 (1969)	41
<u>Brenner v. Local 514, United Bhd of Carpenters & Joiners</u> , 927 F.2d 1283 (3d Cir. 1991)	50, 51
<u>Callanon Road Improvement Co. v. United States</u> , 345 U.S. 507 (1953)	29
<u>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</u> , 477 U.S. 317 (1986)	19
<u>Christiansen v. APV Crepaco, Inc.</u> , 178 F.3d 910 (7th Cir. 1999)	34, 50
<u>Colgan v. Fisher Scientific Co.</u> , 935 F.2d 1407 (3d Cir. 1991)	48
<u>Condon v. Local 2944, United Steelworkers</u> , 683 F.2d 590 (1st Cir. 1982)	43
<u>Davis v. Smith's Transfer Inc.</u> , 841 F.2d 139 (6th Cir. 1988)	49
<u>Deboles v. Trans World Airlines</u> , 552 F.2d 1005 (3d Cir. 1977)	31
<u>Del. State Coll. v. Ricks</u> , 449 U.S. 250 (1980)	48, 51